Studia graeco-arabica

Editorial Board

Mohammad Ali Amir Moezzi, École Pratique des Hautes Études, Paris

Carmela Baffioni, Istituto Universitario Orientale, Napoli

Sebastian Brock, Oriental Institute, Oxford

Charles Burnett, The Warburg Institute, London

Hans Daiber, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität Frankfurt a. M.

Cristina D'Ancona, Università di Pisa

Thérèse-Anne Druart, The Catholic University of America, Washington

Gerhard Endress, Ruhr-Universität Bochum

Richard Goulet, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Paris

Steven Harvey, Bar-Ilan University, Jerusalem

Henri Hugonnard-Roche, École Pratique des Hautes Études, Paris

Remke Kruk, Universiteit Leiden

Concetta Luna, Scuola Normale Superiore, Pisa

Alain-Philippe Segonds (†)

Richard C. Taylor, Marquette University, Milwaukee (WI)

Staff

Cristina D'Ancona, Elisa Coda, Giulia Guidara, Issam Marjani, Cecilia Martini Bonadeo

Submissions

Submissions are invited in every area of the studies on the trasmission of philosophical and scientific texts from Classical Antiquity to the Middle Ages, Renaissance, and early modern times. Papers in English, French, German, Italian, and Spanish are published. Prospect authors are invited to check the *Guidelines* on the website of the journal, and to address their proposals to the Editor in chief.

Peer Review Criteria

Studia graeco-arabica follows a double-blind peer review process. Authors should avoid putting their names in headers or footers or refer to themselves in the body or notes of the article; the title and abstract alone should appear on the first page of the submitted article. All submitted articles are read by the editorial staff. Manuscripts judged to be of potential interest to our readership are sent for formal review to at least one reviewer. Studia graeco-arabica does not release referees' identities to authors or to other reviewers. The journal is committed to rapid editorial decisions.

Subscription orders

Information on subscription rates for the print edition of Volume 7 (2017), claims and customers service: redazione@pacinieditore.it

Web site: http://learningroads.cfs.unipi.it

Service Provider: Università di Pisa, ICT - Servizi di Rete Ateneo

ISSN 2239-012X (Online)

Registration at the law court of Pisa, 18/12, November 23, 2012.

Editor in chief Cristina D'Ancona (cristina.dancona@unipi.it)

Mailing address: Dipartimento di Civiltà e Forme del Sapere, via Pasquale Paoli 15, 56126 Pisa, Italia.



© Copyright 2017 by Industrie Grafiche Pacini Editore, Pisa.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the Publisher. The Publisher remains at the disposal of the rightholders, and is ready to make up for unintentional omissions. *Studia graeco-arabica* cannot be held responsible for the scientific opinions of the authors publishing in it.

Cover

Mašhad, Kitābḥāna-i Āsitān-i Quds-i Raḍawī 300, f. 1v Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, *grec* 1853, f. 186v

Menander in Syriac: From Euthalian Apparatus to Scholia on Gregory of Nazianzus

Yury N. Arzhanov*

Abstract

The collection of moral maxims known as the "Syriac Menander" has much in common with the new Christian educational models of the fourth-fifth centuries, which established the Bible, especially the books of Proverbs and Jesus Sirach, as alternatives to the gnomic collections attributed to Menander. The Syriac reception of the "Euthalian apparatus" adopted for the study of the orations of Gregory of Nazianzus gave birth to new collections of sentences, which were closely connected with the name of Menander. The evidence presented in the article helps us to better understanding the reception of the figure of Menander in Syriac literature.

1. Educational background of the "Syriac Menander"

"Syriac Menander" refers to three collections of moral sentences that differ in volume and in some minor details but in general contain the same version of the text:¹

- (A) The florilegium in BL *Add.* 14658 (ff. 163vb-167vb)² dated to the seventh century is the earliest and largest collection of sentences bearing the title "Menander the Sage said ...".³
- (B) A selection from A is found on the fly-leaves of BL *Add.* 14598 (ff. 1v-3r) under the name "the Greek philosopher Homer".⁴ The codex was copied in the seventh-ninth centuries, but the script of the flyleaves is later and may be dated to the tenth-thirteenth centuries.⁵

^{&#}x27;This article was written as part of the research project "Syrische Gnomologien als Brücke zwischen griechischen und arabischen Spruchsammlungen", sponsored by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, project No. AR 985/1-1). I'd like to thank Joshua Falconer for his valuable suggestions and for having corrected my English.

¹ The sigla are taken from: Y. Arzhanov, "Amrus Philosophus Graecus: A New Witness to the Syriac Sentences of Menander", *Le Muséon* 130.1-2 (2017), pp. 71-121.

² Cf. W. Wright, Catalogue of Syriac manuscripts in the British Museum, acquired since the year 1838, vol. 3, Longmans & Co. - Asher & Co., London 1872, pp. 1154-60.

³ The text of the anthology was published for the first time in J.P.N. Land, *Anecdota Syriaca*, t. 1, Brill, Leiden 1862, pp. 64-73. Cf. A. Baumstark, "Lucubrationes Syro-Graecae", *Jahrbücher für classische Philologie* 21, *Supplementband* (1894), (353-524) pp. 473-90. English translation: T. Baarda, "The Sentences of the Syriac Menander", in J.H. Charlesworth (ed.), *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, vol. 2, Hendrickson Publishers, New York 1985, pp. 583-606. A new edition with an English translation: D.G. Monaco, *The Sentences of the Syriac Menander: Introduction, Text and Translation, and Commentary*, Gorgias Press, Piscataway 2013. Cf. W. Frankenberg, "Die Schrift des Menander (Land *anecd. syr.* I, S. 64ff.), ein Produkt der jüdischen Spruchweisheit", *Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft* 15 (1895), pp. 226-77; J.-P. Audet, "La sagesse de Ménandre l'Égyptien", *Revue biblique* 59 (1952), pp. 55-81.

⁴ Published in: Arzhanov, "Amrus Philosophus Graecus" (above, n. 1).

⁵ Cf. Wright, *Catalogue* (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 731-2; Arzhanov, "Amrus Philosophus Graecus" (above, n. 1), pp. 76-8.

(E) An epitome of A is found in BL Add. 14614 (ff. 116r-117r) dated to the eighth century.6 It was included in a composite anthology of excerpts that comprises ff. 114r-121v of the codex and bears the general title "Select Sayings of the Philosophers on Upright Conduct". The full versions of the fragments inserted in the collection are to a large extent found in BL Add. 14658, i.e. in the codex containing A.

The collection of B ascribed to Homer is a remarkable witness to the combination of the two names in Syriac. Homer is the only figure besides Menander that appears in A in the chreia included in the florilegium, and that could have served as an impulse for the scribe of B to attribute the whole anthology to Homer instead of Menander. The association of both authors is characteristic of the Egyptian papyri that have preserved school exercises used in literary education. A visual expression of this association may be found in double herms from the Roman period.8

The scholastic background9 becomes evident in the following passage of the Syriac florilegium ascribed to "Menander the Sage" (collection A):10

If your son goes forth from his childhood humble and wise, teach him writing and wisdom.

For writing is something that is good to learn.

It means enlightened eyes and excellent tongue.

The motive to learn writing (τὰ γράμματα) is predominant in two Greek-Coptic collections of Menandrou gnomai, which probably derive from a Coptic monastery and include not only the monostichoi, but also quotations from the Book of Proverbs.¹¹ The combination of these two sources is characteristic of the Syriac florilegium which bears the name of Menander. 12 It reflects the educational program established by the writings of the Cappadocian Fathers in the late fourthearly fifth centuries¹³ and adopted in Syriac monasteries. The "Syriac Menander" as product of this cultural development may probably be dated to the fifth-sixth centuries, although this gnomic

⁶ Cf. Wright, Catalogue (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 745-6. The text was published in: E. Sachau, Inedita Syriaca: Eine Sammlung syrischer Übersetzungen von Schriften griechischer Profanliteratur, Kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Halle 1870, pp. 80 [△] - 81 [≺△].

Cf. T. Morgan, Literate Education in the Hellenistic and Roman Worlds, Cambridge U.P., Cambridge 1998, p. 69.

⁸ One of the double herms combining the heads of Homer and Menander may be seen in Rome in the Palazzo Massimo alle Terme that belongs to the Museo Nazionale Romano: cf. S. Nervegna, Menander in Antiquity: The Contexts of Reception, Cambridge U.P., Cambridge 2013, pp. 201-2.

⁹ On rhetorical structures in the sentences of the Syriac Menander see especially A.K. Kirk, *The Composition of the* Sayings Source: Genre, Synchrony, and Wisdom Redaction in Q, Brill, Leiden 1998 (Novum Testamentum, Supplements,

¹⁰ Syriac text: BL Add. 14658, f. 164ra, lines 6-12 (Monaco, Sentences [above, n. 1], p. 60). The English translation

¹¹ D. Hagedorn - M. Weber, "Die griechisch-koptische Rezension der Menandersentenzen", Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik 3 (1968), pp. 15-50; cf. W.E. Crum - H.G. Evelyn -White, The Monastery of Epiphanius at Thebes, Part 2, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York 1926, pp. 320-1.

¹² Cf. Y.N. Arzhanov, "Archäologie eines Textes: Die Menander-Sentenzen in syrischen Spruchsammlungen", Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum 19.1 (2015), pp. 69-88.

¹³ The Christian pedagogical program designed for the monasteries is found in the "Long Rules" of Basil of Caesarea, which are dated to the late fourth century. Cf. L.I. Larsen, "On Learning a New Alphabet: The Sayings of the Desert Fathers and the Monostichs of Menander", in S. Rubenson (ed.), Early Monasticism and Classical Paideia, Peeters, Leuven 2013 (Studia Patristica, 55.3), pp. 59-78.

anthology certainly relied on a number of earlier sources. 14 It expresses the idea of the "fear of God", which became central for the educational program expressed in various monastic sources, including the collection of discourses (*memre*) of Philoxenos of Mabbug (d. 523).¹⁵

The B version of the Syriac Menander (ascribed to Homer) has come down to us on the flyleaves of the codex containing the discourses of Philoxenos. 16 The bishop of Mabbug addressed his writings to the West Syriac monasteries suggesting a pedagogical system for gradual progress in spiritual life, which involved stages of faith, simplicity, and fear of God. The *memre* included a large number of biblical quotations, intended to serve as short exemplary texts and illustrations to the main ideas of the discourses.

The collection of sentences of the Syriac Menander on the flyleaves is not the only additional element to supplement the main text of the BL Add. 14598. Most of the biblical passages coming up in the discourses of Philoxenos are marked in the margins with special signs of angular brackets and dots (•>).17 Near some of these "quotation marks" we find short notes referring to the origins of the passages cited by Philoxenos.

The word مميليم points to one of the Gospels as the source of the quotation, the note الماتعة عنداء to the Book of Acts, عليك to the epistles of Paul, etc. We encounter the names of the biblical figures that also serve as references to the books associated with them: "David" serves as a synonym to the Psalms, "Jacob" and "Rebecca" remind us about the stories of the book of Genesis, and "Elia" and "Elisha" bring us to the stories of the two prophets in the historical books of the Old Testament. 18 A number of didactic remarks (e.g., ש "look", שמאבל "pay attention", במסב "listen", and באסב "write") bring the attention of the readers to particular topics, quotations, and short exemplary stories appearing in the memre of Philoxenos.

What is significant in the marginal notes of this codex is the fact that they are written in the same negligent cursive script as the sentences of the Syriac Menander on the flyleaves and obviously belong to the same hand. Apparently, the scribe was interested in those elements of the discourses of Philoxenos that derived from other sources and could be identified and treated separately from the main text. In several cases the marginal notes in the codex have the form of short sentences which could easily be remembered.¹⁹

¹⁴ The dating of the "Syriac Menander" remains a debated issue; cf. the useful summary in Baarda, "Syriac Menander" (above, n. 3), pp. 584-5.

¹⁵ Cf. A. de Halleux, *Philoxène de Mabbog: sa vie, ses écrits, sa théologie*, Impr. Orientaliste, Leuven 1963. Cf. D.A. Michelson, "A Bibliographic Clavis to the Works of Philoxenos of Mabbug", Hugoye 13.2 (2010), pp. 273-338.

¹⁶ E.A.W. Budge, The Discourses of Philoxenus Bishop of Mabbogh, A.D. 485-519, 2 vols., Asher & Co., London 1894. A new English translation: R. Kitchen, The Discourses of Philoxenos of Mabbug, Cistercian Publications, Collegeville 2014 (Cistercian Studies, 235).

¹⁷ According to Aristonicus Alexandrinus' *De Signis Iliadis*, critical signs have been used in the mss. with the text of the Iliad, cf. Aristonici Περὶ σημείων Ἰλιάδος reliquiae emendatiores, edidit L. Friedlaender, Dieterich, Göttingen 1853. The signs included the $\delta\iota\pi\lambda\tilde{\eta}$ probably looking like >, i.e. similarly to the "quotation marks" in Syriac manuscripts. The practice of marking particular passages in the works of Plato is described by Diogenes Laertius in the Lives of Eminent Philosophers III.65-66 (cf. Diogenes Laertius, Lives of eminent philosophers, ed. T. Dorandi, Cambridge U.P., Cambridge 2013, pp. 276-7). He writes about using the διπλη for marking τὰ δόγματα καὶ τὰ ἀρέσκοντα Πλάτωνι, "doctrines and opinions characteristic of Plato".

¹⁸ The references to the folios of the manuscript, where these marginal notes are found, are given in: Arzhanov, "Amrus Philosophus Graecus" (above, n. 1), pp. 78-80.

¹⁹ Cf. Arzhanov, "Amrus Philosophus Graecus" (above, n. 1), pp. 80-1.

The scribe's interest in the gnomic material resulted in adding a collection of moral sentences on the flyleaves, probably intended to serve for pedagogical purpose. Toward that end, the sentences of the Syriac Menander focus on the idea of the fear of God. The concept of the fear of God played a central role in the pedagogical system of Philoxenos, and the sentences of the Syriac Menander must have served as a useful supplement to the discourses.

The codex containing the B version provides us with an insight into the function of the gnomic sayings in the educational context. Several strategies may be identified based on the examples listed above:

- 1) Marking of "exemplary texts" (from the Bible) with signs of quotations inside the treatises used for educational purposes;
- 2) identifying of the sources of the "exemplary texts" cited anonymously;
- 3) writing down short sentences in the margins of the authoritative texts, deriving either from the texts directly or from other sources;
- 4) adding collections of gnomic sayings attributed to non-Christian authors (Homer/Menander) on the flyleaves.

This practice of transmission of moral maxims in the context of study of the authoritative texts goes back to the tradition that is associated with the name of Philoxenos whose treatises became the object of the scholarly interest in the codex containing selections from the Syriac Menander.

2. Gnomic Sayings in the Euthalian Apparatus

In 508/509 Philoxenos commissioned a new translation of the New Testament which was prepared by Chorepiscopus Polycarp but became associated with the name of the commissioner and is known now as the "Philoxenian" version. The Greek manuscripts that were used for that purpose included the so-called Euthalian material, a scholarly apparatus attached to the Acts of the Apostles, the Pauline Epistles, and the Catholic Epistles.²⁰ Nothing is known for certain about the supposed author of the work or his life. Since he made use of the texts of Eusebius of Caesarea, he probably lived in the fourth century and was familiar with the rhetorical tradition of dividing books into fragments for the sake of reading and scholarly work.²¹ Euthalius himself referred explicitly to an earlier tradition on which his work was based, and his own material was probably also an object of transformation.

The Euthalian apparatus was usually transmitted as an addition to the biblical text. It enjoyed a huge popularity in the Middle Ages and has been preserved in hundreds of Greek mss.²² Translations

²⁰ On the work of Euthalius, see J.A. Robinson, Euthaliana: Studies of Euthalius, Codex H of the Pauline Epistles and the Armenian Version, Cambridge U.P., Cambridge 1895 (Texts and Studies III.3); H. von Soden, Die Schriften des Neuen Testaments I.1, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Göttingen 1911, pp. 637-82; L.C. Willard, A Critical Study of the Euthalian Apparatus, W. de Gruyter, Berlin-New York 2009 (Arbeiten zur neutestamentlichen Textforschung, 41).

²¹ Cf. G. Zuntz, "Euthalius = Euzoius?", Vigiliae Christianae 7 (1953), pp. 16-22.

²² The "Euthalian material" was published on the basis of nine Vatican mss. by L.A. Zacagni, Collectanea monumentorum veterum Ecclesiae graecae ac latinae quae hactenus in Vaticana bibliotheca delituerunt..., vol. 1, Typis Sacrae congreg, de propag, fide, Romae 1698, pp. 401-708. The text of Zacagni was reprinted in PG 85, pp. 627-790. Ernst von Dobschütz used nine additional mss. in his most valuable study: "Euthaliusstudien", Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte 19 (1898), pp. 107-54. Louis Willard (cf. n. 20) reportedly based his study on ca. 400 mss. that were available to him in the microfilm collection at Münster. For an English translation of some sections of the Euthalian apparatus see V. Blomkvist, Euthalian Traditions: Text, Translation and Commentary, W. De Gruyter, Berlin-New York 2012 (Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur), p. 170.

have been made into Armenian, Syriac, Gothic, and Church Slavonic. The Euthalian apparatus included three prologues (to Pauline Epistles, Acts, and Catholic Epistles), lists of chapters (κεφάλαια), and summaries (ὑποθέσεις) of individual books. Additionally, the apparatus included six collections of testimonies (μαρτυρίαι), referring primarily to Old Testament quotations used in the Acts and the Apostolic Epistles with references to their origin in the biblical text. In five cases these lists were preceded by short summaries explaining the system of references in the longer sections.23

The six collections of testimonies by Euthalius provide us with an early example of transmission of sentences of Greek philosophers in context of the study of Christian authoritative texts. Besides the OT quotations, which clearly dominated in the lists of μαρτυρίαι, these lists included some references to the "non-canonical" writings, including the "Apocrypha" of Elia, Moses and Jeremiah, and several classical Greek authors, who are well-known to us from gnomic anthologies: Menander, Homer, and Demades.

A scholion to Acts 17:28 in the apparatus was based on the two proverbs introduced by the Apostle Paul with the words: "As some of your own poets have said ..." The Greek scholiast (known as Euthalius) found it necessary to identify the sources of these quotations and stated that their possible authors were "Aratus the Astronomer and Homer the Poet". 24

A sentence attributed to Menander appears in the part dealing with the Pauline Epistles. The admonition of the Apostle in 1 Cor. 15:33 implemented a hidden quotation from the gnomai monostichoi of Menander:

μή πλανᾶσθε· φθείρουσιν ήθη χρηστά όμιλίαι κακαί Do not be deceived: "Bad company ruins good morals".25

It was probably the rhetorical education of the scholiast that helped him to correctly identify the source of the words of the Apostle, which is combined with another identification connected with the preceding verse of 1 Cor. and presented as a "Laconian proverb":²⁶

ΔΙΙΙΙ. ξβ΄. Λακωνική παροιμία α΄, Φάγωμεν, καὶ πίωμεν, αὔριον γὰρ ἀποθνήσκομεν.

ΔΠ. ξγ΄. Μενάνδρου κωμφδιογράφου γνώμη α΄, Φθείρουσιν ήθη χρηστὰ όμιλίαι κακαί.

XIV (62) First Laconian proverb: "Let us eat and drink, for tomorrow we die".

XV (63) First maxim of the comic writer Menander: "Bad company ruins good morals".

²³ On the system of references in the Euthalian lists of quotations cf. Robinson, *Euthaliana* (above, n. 20), pp. 18-20; Willard, Critical Study (above, n. 20), p. 30.

²⁴ Zacagni, Collectanea (above, n. 22), p. 420. The first proverb quoted by Paulus is found by Stobaeus in a fragment attributed to Aratus (Stob. I.1.3: Joannis Stobaei Anthologii libri duo priores, vol. 1, rec. C. Wachsmuth, Weidmann, Berlin 1884, p. 23.16).

²⁵ The text of the Bible is quoted according to the *Revised Standard Version*. The Greek text: B. Aland *et al.* (eds.), Novum Testamentum Graece, 28th Revised Ed., Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, Stuttgart 2012, p. 550. Menander, Gnomai monostichoi, No. 808: S. Jaekel, Menandri Sententiae. Comparatio Menandri et Philistionis, Teubner, Leipzig 1964 (Bibliotheca scriptorum Graecorum et Romanorum Teubneriana), p. 79.

²⁶ Zacagni, *Collectanea* (above, n. 22), p. 558. Cf. the preceding short summary: Μενάνδρου γνώμη Ι ιε. Δημάδου λακωνική παροιμία Ι. ιδ. — "One sentence of Menander (testimony No. 15); one proverb of Demades the Laconian (testimony No. 14)" (Zacagni, ibid., p. 543). Another summary: Μενάνδρου γνώμη α΄. Λακωνική, καὶ ἀρχαῖα παροιμία α'. — "One sentence of Menander; one old Laconian proverb" (Zacagni, *ibid.*, p. 546).

The Euthalian apparatus has come down to us in several Syriac mss. containing the biblical text and in diverse anthologies.²⁷ The Bible-mss. are BL *Add.* 7157 (eighth century, East Syriac)²⁸ and Oxford *New College* 333 (dated to the eleventh century).²⁹ The Euthalian materials included in them differ from one another, and the analyses of Dobschütz and Brock have demonstrated that the BL codex contains a revised version (which appeared during its transmission in the sixth century) of the "Philoxenian" translation of the NT.³⁰ The version of the Euthalian scholia in the Oxford codex reflects the later Bible translation, which was made in 615/616 by Thomas of Harkel. There, in the margin near 1 Cor. 15:33, we find the short note:³¹

מיעעשי העונים הטיזיאין עידין

(This is) a proverb of the comic writer Menander (found in) *Thais*.

The "pagan testimonies" included in the Euthalian apparatus are transmitted separately in two ninth century Syriac mss.: BL Add. 17193 (ff. 3v-4r) 32 and Saint Mark's Monastery of Jerusalem (SMMJ) 124 (ff. 5v-6r). 33 The BL codex represents the earlier version of the materials going back to the translation arranged by Philoxenos of Mabbug and later associated with his name. 34 The title of the collection makes apparent that it is extracted from the "Philoxenian" NT^{35} and contains a selection of $\mu\alpha\rho\tau\nu\rho\prime\alpha\iota$ taken "from pagan sages and apocryphal books".

The Jerusalem codex includes the same selection of "testimonies" based on the Euthalian apparatus. This selection is not separated from other materials but forms part of the larger section containing "sayings of the pagans that were included by the teachers in their works". This ms. contains another version of the Euthalian apparatus which is very close to the one preserved in Oxford 333, going back to the Harklean version of the NT.³⁶

Transmission of a similar collection in both mss. demonstrates a constant interest of the Syriac scholars (starting with the Philoxenian work at the beginning of the sixth century) in the quotations from "pagan authors" as transmitted by those texts that were sanctioned by the Church and thus legitimized for use.

²⁷ Cf. Dobschütz, "Euthaliusstudien", Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte 19 (1898), pp. 107-54; S.P. Brock, "The Syriac Euthalian Material and the Philoxenian Version of the NT", Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft 70.1-2 (1979), pp. 120-30; B. Aland - A. Juckel (eds.), Das Neue Testament in syrischer Überlieferung, vol. II.1: Römer- und 1. Korintherbrief, W. de Gruyter, Berlin 1991 (Arbeiten zur neutestamentlichen Text-forschung, 14), \pp. 67-9.

²⁸ J. Forshall - F.A. Rosen, Catalogus codicum manuscriptorum orientalium qui in Museo Britannico asservantur. Pars prima: codices syriacos et carshunicos amplectens, Impensis curatorum Musei Britannici, London 1838, pp. 15-18.

²⁹ H.O. Coxe, Catalogus codicum mss. qui in collegiis aulisque oxoniensibus hodie adservantur. Catalogus codicum MSS. Collegii Novi, Typ. Acad., Oxford 1852, p. 119.

³⁰ Dobschütz, Euthaliusstudien (above, n. 27), p. 136; Brock, "Syriac Euthalian Material" (above, n. 27).

³¹ Ms. Oxford, New College 333, f. 228v, between the columns.

³² Cf. Wright, *Catalogue* (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 989-1002.

 $^{^{33}}$ Cf. the description in the database of vHMML (https://www.vhmml.org/) where this ms. has the number SMMJ_00124.

³⁴ Cf. Brock, "Syriac Euthalian Material" (above, n. 27).

The BL version of [1] beginning with ris not supported by the quotations of this verse by Philoxenos, who has either (as in *SMMJ*) or .cf. Aland-Juckel, *Das Neue Testament*, vol. II/1 (above, n. 25), p. 298.

³⁶ Published as "E²H" in: Brock, "The Syriac Euthalian Material" (above, n. 27).

Synoptic edition of the two versions:³⁷

BL *Add.* 17193 (E¹)

 $SMMI 124 (E^2)$

בבבעבה אין ציקשט [...]

Euth. App. (Zacagni)

تلله دوته وتدهم مر تعلم ومرسه وملحصون تلله وبالمحدة مهامه می سقیمی دی، ممرمه

رمديه براء برعني

תיא ידיזי ען יריאי לאי לאין [1] κά κιπκο διμ κά κιπκο διμ κά κιπκο οὐκ ἴδεν, καὶ οὖς οὐκ ἤκουσε, καὶ κί κει τοι Ισο Ασεκ κί κει τοι Ισο Ασεκ κί επὶ καρδίαν ἀνθρώπου οὐκ ἀνέβη, ape cera ette sper par بندحم لم

ii κλιμο Δασκί ii κλιμο Δασκί Φάγωμεν, καὶ πίωμεν, αὔριον γὰρ out is to set no KUZK

حقيمكم عمتيلاكم حذبةلك oly ch sikh rhad anind, « محمرة ملعل حب عبره المام Kelly.

こっちょう べかり

r.Lok スタッグス ಎಂಶಿಂ Kensik

σορα καλεύδων, καὶ κακλ. Έγειρε, ὁ καθεύδων, καὶ cut kiny vinui po kany حم ١٤٨٨ ، المالم وعلىومتميم لجمعامةه بجىمىملىقەم orcerpy organic ops a Kunta autua zarpu du es son

cont but the How. nc<u>r</u>ank خالماله م

ιωρίνου γνώμη (3) καικίου αρκοντικού μη το καικίου αρκοντικού μη νίαι γοροτά όμιλίαι κατος και κάτος και και Αίναι α΄, Φθείρουσιν ήθη χρηστά όμιλίαι 💠 🖒 تعدم × معرن. [558 b 9-11]

α (4) الاستونون (4) الاستراك من المنام (4) الاستونون (4) المنام σωλικ κλίοι τι κλ σωλικ στο κλίοι τι κλ γάρ περιτομή τί ἐστιν, οὐτε κάκ κλαίος. κάο καινή κτίσις.

ω, το μο [6] ου το κοι [6] Ἐπιμενίδου جمعیت حمامیت « مالیات مهمیت مهیت [567 a 23-25]

κειι κείκι κειίς το [1] 'Ηλία ἀποκρύφου α΄. Ἡ ὀφθαλμὸς * Καίνασεν ὁ θεὸς τοῖς ἀγαπῶσιν αὐτὸν. [556 b 16-20]

> παροιμία άποθνήσκομεν. [558 b 6-8]

(Λακωνική, καὶ ἀρχαῖα παροιμία α΄. [546 b 14-15])

* Κυτες Α΄ iωτο Κατες άνάστα ἐκ τῶν νεκρῶν, καὶ ἐπιφαύσει σοι δ Χριστός. [561 a 22-25] Έν τῆ πρὸς Φιλιππησίους, καὶ πρὸς Κολασσαεῖς, καὶ πρὸς Θεσσαλονικεῖς πρώτη τε, καὶ δευτέρα οὐδοπόθεν έμνημόνευσε όητοῦ Παῦλος ό Άπόστολος. [562 b 8-12]

Κρητὸς ιζος α΄. Κρῆτες ἀεὶ ψεῦσται, . απ κλι π σιλο κλιω . αποδικ κλι π κακά θηρία, γαστέρες άργαί.

³⁷ Cf. the edition of BL *Add.* 17193 (E¹) in Brock, "Syriac Euthalian Material" (above, n. 27).

Translation of the two Syriac collections:

BL Add, 17193

SMMJ 124

Of the holy Philoxenos: The sayings that Paul quoted from Sayings of the pagans that were included by the teachers in pagan sages and apocryphal books.

their works (...)

- [1] From an apocryphal book: "What no eye has seen, nor [1] From the Revelation of the prophet Elijah: "What no prepared for those who love him" [1 Cor. 2:9].
- ear heard, nor the heart of man conceived, what God has eye has seen, nor ear heard, nor the heart of man conceived
- tomorrow we die" [1 Cor. 15:32]. It is also used by Isaiah tomorrow we die". [cf. Is. 22:13].
- [2] An old Laconian proverb: "Let us eat and drink, for [2] An old Laconian proverb: "Let us eat and drink, for
- [3] Proverb of Menander the diviner in *Thais*:³⁸ "Bad [3] Proverb of the comic writer Menander: "Bad company company ruins good morals" [1 Cor. 15:33].
- ruins good morals".

These are in the Epistle to Corinthians. And a little further: In the Epistle to Galatians.

- a new creation" [Gal. 6:15].
- [4] Words from an apocryphal book: "For neither [4] From the Revelation of Moses: "For neither circumcision counts for anything, nor uncircumcision, but circumcision counts for anything, nor uncircumcision, but a new creation".

Further in the Epistle to Ephesians:

- [5] From an apocryphal book: "Awake, O sleeper, and arise [5] From the Revelation of the prophet Jeremiah: "Awake, from the dead, and Christ shall give you light" [Eph. 5:14]. O sleeper, and arise from the dead, and Christ shall give you
 - light".

In the Epistles to Philippians and Colossians, and in the First and Second Epistle to Thessalonians, Paul did not mention any saying from another source.

A quotation from the Epistle to Titus:

- [6] Oracle of Epimenides, a diviner from Crete: "Cretans [6] Oracle of Epimenides, the Cretan diviner: "Cretans are are always liars, evil beasts, lazy gluttons" [Tit. 1:12].
 - always liars, evil beasts, lazy gluttons".

The Syriac translation of the Euthalian apparatus transmitted to the Syriac readers the only sentence of the "comic writer Menander" (who in the BL codex is called surprisingly a "diviner") that we may directly associate with the Greek corpus of his sentences. The version of the BL codex (first column; cf. the note in Ms. Oxford 331) even gives the title of the comedy (*Thais*) where it could be found.

³⁸ The form with is most likely a corruption of with.

Elements in the BL codex attest to their provenance from the Euthalian apparatus. This version includes accurate references to the NT books, increasing the likelihood that the collection of the BL ms. derives from a larger corpus of Euthalian material.

The Jerusalem codex version stands closer in many respects to the Euthalian text known to us from the edition of Zacagni, although it lacks those elements which clearly associate it with the Euthalian tradition. The Jerusalem codex integrated the "pagan witnesses" taken from the Euthalian apparatus in the larger collection of "pagan witnesses" found by the Christian authors. The anthology includes the "Prophecies of Greek Philosophers about Christ", mythological scholia on the writings of Gregory of Nazianzus, and selected sayings of Greek authors found in the orations of Gregory (cf. below). The Jerusalem anthology points thus at the afterlife of the Euthalian method that was applied by the Syriac scholars to the writings of the Church authorities, first of all to those of Gregory of Nazianzus.

3. Gnomic sentences among scholia on the orations of Gregory of Nazianzus

Gregory of Nazianzus (330-390) played a decisive role not only in the development of the Christian theology of the fourth century (the role which brought him the epithet "Theologian") but also in the Christian reception of the Late Antique system of education. Having received the full scope of the enkyklios paideia, Gregory provided the Church with the Christian works shaped after classical rhetorical models and including plenty of explicit quotations from and anonymous references to the ancient authors.³⁹ The works of Gregory, especially his poems and orations, became for Christian readers vehicles of transmission of the Late Antique gnomic materials.⁴⁰

The monostichs of Menander turned out to be an important source of quotations for Gregory. 41 One of the Menandrean sentences is found in Carmen I.2.39, and the poem "On virtue" (I.2.10) contains large blocks of quotations taken from *gnomai monostichoi* and other gnomic anthologies, known to Gregory through his rhetorical education. 42 The short Carmen morale 30 was composed as a stylization of the gnomai monostichoi and in the Arabic tradition was transmitted as an anthology of sentences of Menander.⁴³

A large corpus of writings of Gregory of Nazianzus was translated into Syriac, some of them several times.⁴⁴ His orations were translated twice,⁴⁵ and the Syriac mss. containing them⁴⁶ reveal a close interest of Syriac scholars in the quotations from "pagan" authors included in the works of "the

³⁹ Cf. K. Demoen, Pagan and Biblical Exempla in Gregory Nazianzen: A Study in Rhetoric and Hermeneutics, Brepols, Turnhoult 1996 (Corpus Christianorum, Lingua Patrum 2).

⁴⁰ Cf. H.L. Davids, *De gnomologieën van sint Gregorius van Nazianze*, Dekker en Van de Vegt, Nijmegen-Utrecht 1940.

⁴¹ Cf. S. Azzarà, "Fonti e rielaborazione poetica nei Carmina moralia di Gregorio di Nazianzo", in M.S. Funghi (ed.), Aspetti di letteratura gnomica nel mondo antico I, L.S. Olschki, Firenze 2003, pp. 53-69.

⁴² Azzarà, "Fonti e rielaborazione poetica" (above, n. 41), pp. 56-9.

⁴³ Cf. M. Ullmann, *Die arabische Überlieferung der sogenannten Menandersentenzen*, Steiner, Wiesbaden 1961 (Abhandlung für die Kunde des Morgenlandes 34.1), pp. 74-80.

⁴⁴ On the Syriac reception of Gregory of Nazianzus cf. C. Detienne, "Grégoire de Nazianze dans la tradition syriaque", in B. Coulie (ed.), Studia Nazianzenica I, Brepols, Turnhout 2000 (Corpus Christianorum Series Graeca [CCSG] 41, Corpus Nazianzenum 8), pp. 175-83; A.B. Schmidt, "The Literary Tradition of Gregory of Nazianzus in Syriac Literature and its Historical Context", The Harp 11-12 (1998-1999), pp. 127-34.

⁴⁵ Cf. W. Lüdtke, "Zur Überlieferung der Reden Gregors von Nazianz", Oriens Christianus 3 (1913), pp. 263-5; A. de Halleux, "La version syriaque des Discours de Grégoire de Nazianze", in J. Mossay (ed.), II. Symposium Nazianzenum, Schöningh, Padeborn et al, 1983, pp. 75-111.

⁴⁶ Cf. A. Van Roey - H. Moors, "Les discours de Saint Grégoire de Nazianze dans la littérature syriaque" I-II, Orientalia Lovaniensia Periodica 4 (1973), pp. 121-33; 5 (1974), pp. 79-125.

Theologian". A Greek series of scholia on Gregory's references to Greek mythology in *Orations* 4, 5, 39, and 43 ascribed to a certain Nonnus were translated into Syriac twice and usually attached to the orations.⁴⁷ The early versions of both orations and scholia have been preserved only in fragmentary form; the second translation was made in 623/624 by the prolific scholar Paul of Edessa. 48

The gnomic elements found in the writings of Gregory became objects of special attention of Syriac readers, resulting in marginal notes referring to the origins of the quotations, in scholarly notes, and finally in excerpting them with the purpose of building new gnomic collections.⁴⁹ Commentaries and scholia on the orations of Gregory turn out to have much in common with the method of treatment of the "pagan testimonies" in the Euthalian apparatus and they were probably based on the same scholarly tradition.

Ms. BL Add. 14549 dated to the eighth/ninth centuries contains a collection of the discourses of Gregory of Nazianzus in a translation by Paul of Edessa. 50 In the margins of this codex we find notes referring to the Greek mythological figures, philosophers, and scholars (which appear also in the scholia of Ps.-Nonnus): Euclid, Palamedes, Daedalus, etc.⁵¹ These figures are found in *Oration* 28, where the "Theologian" attacks with harsh words the Greek non-Christian philosophy.⁵² The series of critical remarks is interrupted several times by few positive examples of Greek philosophers who remained anonymous in the oration. Similar to the "pagan exempla" in the Euthalian apparatus, these anonymous references were identified in the marginal notes attached to the text of the oration in BL Add. 14549:

In the opening section Gregory refers to "one of the theologians of the Greeks" (τις τῶν παρ' "Ελλησι θεολόγων) who stated the impossibility of defining God in words.⁵³ The same passage quoted anonymously in Oration 28, is ascribed to Hermes Trismegistos by Cyril of Alexandria and Stobaeus.⁵⁴ A marginal note suggests the same authorship in the Syriac codex: عنانعمدانمون (sic).55

⁴⁷ J. Nimmo Smith (ed.), Pseudo-Nonniani in IV Orationes Gregorii Nazianzeni Commentarii, Brepols, Turnhout 1993 (CCSG 27, Corpus Nazianzenum 2). English translation: J. Nimmo Smith, The Christian's Guide to Greek Culture: The Pseudo-Nonnus Commentaries on Sermons 4, 5, 39 and 43 by Gregory of Nazianzus, Liverpool U.P., Liverpool 2001 (Translated Texts for Historians 37).

⁴⁸ Cf. S.P. Brock, *The Syriac Version of the Pseudo-Nonnos Mythological Scholia*, Cambridge U.P., Cambridge 1971.

⁴⁹ Cf. A.de Halleux, "Les commentaires syriaques des Discours de Grégoire de Nazianze: Un premier sondage", *Le* Muséon 98.1-2 (1985), pp. 103-47.

⁵⁰ Cf. Wright, Catalogue (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 428-31; Van Roey-Moors, "Les discours de Saint Grégoire II" (above, n. 46), pp. 108-13.

⁵¹ BL Add. 14549, f. 24r-v.

⁵² PG 36, 25-74; J. Barbel (ed.), Gregor von Nazianz, Die fünf theologischen Reden, Patmos Verlag, Düsseldorf 1963, pp. 62-126; P. Gallay (ed.), Grégoire de Nazianze, Discours 27-31 (discours théologiques), Éditions du Cerf, Paris 1978 (Sources chrétiennes 250), pp. 100-74. English translation: Ch.G. Browne - J.E. Swallow, "Select Orations of Saint Gregory Nazianzen", in Ph. Schaff - H. Wace (eds.), A Select Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church, Second series, vol. 7, The Christian Literature Company, New York 1894, pp. 288b-301a. Two Syriac versions of the oration were published in Sancti Gregorii Nazianzeni Opera. Versio Syriaca IV: Orationes XXVIII, XXIX, XXX, XXXI, ed. J.-Cl. Haelewyck, Brepols, Turnhout 2007 (CCSG 65; Corpus Nazianzenum 23).

 $^{^{53}}$ Θεὸν νοῆσαι μὲν χαλεπόν \cdot φράσαι δὲ ἀδύνατον, ὥς τις τῶν παρ' «Ελλησι θεολόγων ἐφιλοσόφησεν (PG 36, 29C= 106-108 Gallay = 70 Barbel). English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 289b. The Syriac version: Haelewyck, Sancti Gregorii Nazianzeni Opera. Versio Syriaca IV (above, n. 52), p. 17.

⁵⁴ Cyril Alexandrinus, Contra Julianum I.43 [P. Burguière - P. Évieux (eds.), Cyrille d'Alexandrie. Contre Julien, tome 1: livres 1 et 2, Éditions du Cerf, Paris 1985 (SC 322), p. 190]; Stob., Antol., II.1.26 (Wachsmuth, vol. 2, p. 9).

⁵⁵ BL Add. 14549, f. 17r.

An unnamed Greek author is praised twice in the oration as a "foreign" (ἀλλότριος) philosopher who expressed ideas which are closest to Christian teachings on God as Creator of the universe. In both cases Gregory must have been thinking of Plato,⁵⁶ and these references were made explicit by a Syriac commentator, who wrote Plato's name in the margins.⁵⁷

The marginal notes in the Syriac codex attached to Oration 28 were probably based either on some oral tradition or on commentaries to the writings of "the Theologian". In the same ms., the provenance of the attribution in the marginal note to *Oration* 26⁵⁸ is not quite clear:

At the beginning of the oration, the author quotes an anonymous aphorism: "Thus we are slow to desire what is within easy reach, as one of the ancients has said".⁵⁹ A commentator added in the margin near this passage: "This (saying) belongs to Socrates". 60 No other instances of this attribution are known. 61

The quoted commentaries in the margins of BL Add. 14549 focus on those quotations by "the Theologian" that remained anonymous and transmitted sayings and ideas of non-Christian authors whose works were absent from the Christian schools. The method of selection and identification of the quotations remind us of the few non-Christian testimonies (μαρτυρίαι) included in the Euthalian apparatus.

The similarity to the Euthalian method becomes even stronger in those mss. that transmit scholia on the orations of Gregory. One of these collections is found in BL Add. 17147 dated to the eighth/ ninth centuries. ⁶² The scholia include fragments of the orations, commentaries on difficult terms, and lists of biblical quotations, which bear the title καιώμα, a Syriac equivalent to the Greek μαρτυρίαι. With few exceptions, the "testimonies" in these sections derive from the Bible, as is the case in the Euthalian apparatus. In the list of "testimonies" extracted from Oration 26, the first one is the sentence quoted above, which in this case is directly attributed to Socrates. 63 This example demonstrates how a gnomic saying found and identified in the writing of Gregory begins to take a life of its own.

Another collection of scholia to the writings of Gregory produced in the school of Rabban Benjamin (whose activity is dated to the ninth century)⁶⁴ is found in the BL Add. 14725 (ff. 100-215, dated to the tenth/eleventh centuries).⁶⁵ Among the scholia to *Oration* 2 we find the first Hippocratic Aphorism.

⁵⁶ Thus the modern commentaries to the oration, cf. Gallay, Grégoire de Nazianze, Discours 27-31 (above, n. 52), p. 134, n. 1; Barbel, Gregor von Nazianz (above, n. 52), p. 96, n. 44.

⁵⁷ BL *Add.* 14549, f. 21v () and f. 26v ().

⁵⁸ PG 35, pp. 1227–1252; J. Mossay (ed.), Grégoire de Nazianze, Discours 24-26, Éditions du Cerf, Paris 1981 (SC 284), pp. 224-72. English translation: M. Vinson, St. Gregory of Nazianzus, Select Orations, Catholic University of America Press, Washington 2003, pp. 175-90.

⁵⁹ Οὕτως τὸ ἔτοιμον εἰς ἐξουσίαν, ἀργὸν εἰς ἐπιθυμίαν, ὥς τις ἔφη τῶν πρὸ ἡμῶν (PG 35, 1229B = 228 Mossay). The English translation is taken from Vinson, Select Orations (above, n. 58), p. 176. Syriac (f. 32v): عند المحالية المراجعة الم .تحرارت اعدالمب دراماله مود لا مرم بدم بدم محذ مر مدر ومدر

⁶⁰ BL Add. 14549, f. 32v, right margin: را من المنافرة على المنافرة المناف

⁶¹ In later Byzantine *florilegia* this sentence is ascribed to Aesop, cf. B.E. Perry, *Aesopica*, vol. 1, University of Illinois Press, Urbana 1952, p. 280 (No. 103).

⁶² Cf. Wright, Catalogue (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 438-440.

⁶³ BL Add. 17147, f. 116r, line 15.

⁶⁴ Cf. A. de Halleux, "Rabban Benjamin d'Édesse et la date du ms. B.L., Or., 8731", in IV Symposium Syriacum 1984: Literary Genres in Syriac Literature (Groningen-Oosterhesselen 10-12 September), ed. by H.J.W. Drijvers, Pont. Institutum Studiorum Orientalium, Roma 1987 (Orientalia Christiana analecta 229), pp. 445-51.

⁶⁵ Wright, Catalogue (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 441-3.

On one occasion, Gregory speaks of the brevity of human life, ⁶⁶ and this note brought one Syriac scholar (Rabban Benjamin?) to recall the famous maxim, "Life is short, the art is long", 67 serving as some sort of illustration of the main line of thought in the oration, which is full of medical images.

On the other folio of the same codex, we find another famous aphorism containing medical imagery: "Physician, heal thyself!" 68 Similar to the sentences of the Syriac Menander attached to the discourses of Philoxenos, the two maxims serve as short gnomic supplements to the text of Gregory, expressing in aphoristic form the ideas of the Church Father.

In BL Add. 14549 mentioned above, on f. 198r, we find a Syriac version of the famous sayings of the Seven Sages of Greece immediately following the Ps.-Nonnus mythological scholia attached to Oration 5.

The examples listed above testify to the fact that the works of Gregory of Nazianzus in Syriac turned out to be an important channel of transmission for the gnomic materials that were seen as "pagan testimonies" used by the Church Father and legitimized by his authority. The anonymous passages were ascribed to famous Greek authors and transmitted among the "testimonies" extracted from the writings of Gregory.

4. Menander in the Gnomic Anthology of SMMJ 124

As in case of the "pagan testimonies" in the Euthalian apparatus, the maxims of the non-Christian authors found in the text of Gregory were also transmitted separately, forming new gnomic collections. An example of such a collection is found in SMMJ 124, which also includes the selection from the Euthalian apparatus.

The anthology of "pagan testimonies" in SMMJ 124 includes the following parts:

- ff. 2r 4r "Prophecies of pagan philosophers about Christ", nearly identical to the collection preserved in Dayr al-Suryan 27⁶⁹
- f. 4v "Sayings of philosophers" taken from the orations of Gregory of Nazianzus (cf. below)
- ff. 4v 5r Mythological scholia on the orations of Gregory
- ff. 5r 6r "Sayings of the pagans that were included by the teachers in their works:" the anthology includes a number of stories about the fall of Troy⁷⁰ and non-Christian testimonies taken from the Euthalian apparatus (cf. above)

⁶⁶ Or. 2, § 39: "A suitable and worthy comprehension and exposition of this subject demands a discussion of greater length than the present occasion, or even our life, as I suppose, allows ..." (Ταῦτ' οὖν μακροτέρου μὲν ἢ κατὰ τὸν παρόντα καιρὸν, οἶμαι δὲ καὶ βίον, τοῦ λόγου καὶ νοῆσαι καὶ παραστῆσαι ίκανῶς τε καὶ ὅσον ἄξιον – PG 35, 448A = 83 Bernardi). English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 213a. Syriac edition: J.-Cl. Haelewyck (ed.), Sancti Gregorii Nazianzeni Opera. Versio Syriaca V: Orationes I, II, III, Brepols, Louvain 2011 (Corpus Christianorum Series Graeca 77, Corpus Nazianzenum 25), p. 45.

⁶⁷ BL Add. 14725, f. 146vb: סיים אווי הוא בשם אין האואס האווי האואס אוויס אוויס אוויס אוויס ווויס אוויס אוויס אוויס אוויס אוויס ווויס אוויס אייס אוויס אווי transmission of the first Hippocratic Aphorism cf. G.M. Kessel, "'Life is Short, the Art is Long': An Interpretation of the First Hippocratic Aphorism by an East Syriac Monk in the 7th Century Iraq (Isaac of Nineveh, Kephalaia gnostica 3,62)", Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum 19 (2015), pp. 137-48.

⁶⁸ BL *Add.* 14725, f. 133r, between the columns: ΥΣΩ ΚΩΚ ΚΙΩΚ.

⁶⁹ See S.P. Brock - L. Van Rompay (eds.), Catalogue of the Syriac Manuscripts and Fragments in the Library of Deir al-Surian, Wadi al-Natrun (Egypt), Peeters, Leuven et al. 2014 (Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta, 227), pp. 164-5, 172-3. On the "Prophecies" cf. S.P. Brock, "A Syriac Collection of Prophecies of the Pagan Philosophers", Orientalia Lovaniensia Periodica 14 (1983), pp. 203-46; Id., "Some Syriac Excerpts from Greek Collections of Pagan Prophecies", Vigiliae Christianae 38 (1984), pp. 77-90.

⁷⁰ Cf. A. Hilkens, "Syriac *Ilioupersides*: The Fall of Troy in Syriac Historiography", *Le Muséon* 126.3-4 (2013), pp. 285-317.

This curious compendium combines elements of several collections that must have served as reference works for Syriac readers about classical Greek literature. The aphorisms from the orations of Gregory fulfill the role of gnomic sentences ascribed to famous poets, orators, and philosophers. The ascriptions in this collection are rather unique and seem not to be based on any known tradition:

The sayings of the philosophers: جم محمد خدام المعانية ا רביבס: שמע מלסהא הבינה בהוא של Whence did the holy Theologian and the other teachers take each one of them.

- * ס גאוויס היא במאא במאא היא [1] First (saying): "Reap a harvest of the individual sorrows". מרכינא א This is (a sentence) of Archigenes.

 - יה איט יאר שלב איט יסוב ביים ביים ביים ביים (2) Second: "'Let us learn the potter's art through a wine-🌣 גרעגוסס ה גרעגוסס jar,' as it is said". This is (a sentence) of Menander.

 - * തി. ന് രൂപ് പ്രാവ് പ്രവ്യാഗ പ്രാവ് പ്രവ്യാഗ പ്രവാധ പ്രവ്യാഗ പ്രവ്യാശ പ്രവ്യാഗ പ്രാഗ പ്രവ്യാഗ പ്രവ്യാശ the same author.

 - * లాగు . అండు ఆ గ్రామంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలోకి కార్యంలో కార్యంలోకి కార్యంలో కార్యంలోకి కార్యంలో కారంలో కార్యంలో the same author.
- - good wife". This is (a sentence) of Demosthenes.
 - معدنه عديد هم كم محدد (6) Sixth: "A good thing is not good until it happens in a
 - 🌣 מס גענגוס אראיש good way". This is (a sentence) of Menander.
 - * من تحمد عوده بي المناس . [7] Seventh: "How can I hide something that is overflowed". ه. من المناس بعوده المناس المناسبة المناس
 - This is (a sentence) of Plutarch.

 - * במלה בי הי גישלה exalt yourself". This is (a sentence) of Solon.
- $\bar{\phi}$ בביג העלי שולא כש בארא איליים מאלא איליים מאלא איליים אוואר: "Ah work! Stronger than any word we speak".
 - * הגבעהוסם This is (a sentence) of Menander.
- עהר אור (10) Tenth: "Ah, the masses take me for a fool,' as someone איר אור אור ייי אור אור ייי אור אור ייי אור אור ייי לים אנא הסבולים. said". This is (a sentence) of Democritus.

 - sentence) of Menander.
 - - * הבסשמעם fastened". This is (a sentence) of Demosthenes.

The sayings derive from the orations of Gregory in the translation of Paul of Edessa.⁷¹

[1] Οτ. 2, \$27: καὶ τὸ ἐπ' ἀλλοτρίαις συμφοραῖς ἰδίας καρποῦσθαι λύπας, ὡς ἔφη τις τῶν παρ' ἐκείνοις σοφῶν — "they will reap a harvest of pain for themselves from the distresses of others, as one of their wise men said".72

The Syriac version of Paul: نصرة معلم معلم معلم معلق من تعمد تعمد علم بنهم בי מישי אין יולי בייבי בא צוע.

The maxim goes back to the beginning of the Hippocrates' tract De Flatibus, 74 where physicians are described as persons who bear the sufferings of their patients. It is probably the motive of suffering for the sake of the others that led some Christian authors to apply it to Jesus,⁷⁵ though Gregory's use of it does not imply this meaning. No association of it with Archigenes of Apamea may be traced.⁷⁶

[2] Or. 2, §47: ἐν πίθω τὴν κεραμείαν μανθάνειν, τὸ δὴ λεγόμενον — "to learn, as men say, the potter's art on a wine-jar".77

The Syriac translation of Paul: 78 Kishkis, in ala khoise Kosakis Ansara Cosakis Ansara Cosakis

The proverb goes back to Plato's Gorgias, where it is already quoted as a well-known maxim.⁷⁹ It was used in rhetorical exercises, 80 and this is probably how Gregory learned it as an anonymous maxim. No reason of attributing it to Menander may be established except the association of the latter's name with the gnomic genre.

⁷¹ I am most grateful to Bastien Kindt (Université Catholique de Louvain, Institut Orientaliste), who provided me with the access to the database of the Syriac versions of Gregory of Nazianzus, prepared in the project "GREGORI". It was due to the database GREgORI that I was able to check my identifications and find parallels to sentences [6], [7], and [12], which until then had remained a mystery for me.

⁷² PG 35, 436B = 124 Bernardi. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 210b.

⁷³ Or. 2, § 27.2-4, versio nova (67 Haelewyck).

^{🏸 ΄}Ο μὲν γὰρ ἰητρὸς ὁρῇ τε δεινὰ, θιγγάνει τε ἀηδέων, ἐπ' ἀλλοτρίησί τε ξυμφορῆσιν ἰδίας καρποῦται λύπας (ed. É. Littré, Œuvres complètes d'Hippocrate, vol. 6, Baillière, Paris 1849 (repr. Hakkert, Amsterdam 1962), pp. 90-114, see 90.5-6). It is quoted as a maxim of Hippocrates in the commentary to Homer's *Iliad* of the twelfth century Byzantine scholar Eustathius, archbishop of Thessalonica, who probably drew this knowledge on the earlier Homeric commentaries. See M. van der Valk (ed.), Eustathii archiepiscopi Thessalonicensis commentarii ad Homeri Iliadem pertinentes, vol. 4, Brill, Leiden 1987, p. 410.16-18.

⁷⁵ Eusebius of Caesarea (fourth century) quotes this passage in Historia Ecclesiastica X.4.11 referring to Jesus who is presented as a doctor who takes upon himself the sufferings of people, "handles their foul sores, and reaps pain for himself from the miseries of another (θιγγάνει δ' ἀηδέων ἐπ' ἀλλοτρίησί τε ξυμφορήσιν ἰδίας καρποῦται λύπας)" (Eusebius, Werke, ed. E. Schwartz, vol. 2.2, Hinrichs'sche Buchhandlung, Leipzig 1908, p. 866.8-9).

⁷⁶ Galen often refers to Archigenes (Άρχιγένης) of Apamea as an authority, especially in issues of the pulse. This may explain the attribution as association with a medical issue.

⁷⁷ PG 35, 456B = 152 Bernardi. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 214b.

⁷⁸ Or. 2, § 47.11, versio nova (99 Haelewyck). The two Syriac versions differ in only one letter (1) which marks the beginning of a quotation in versio nova. This particle a is quoted in the sentence among the scholia, which speaks again for the versio nova as the basis for the scholia.

⁷⁹ Gorgias 514E: τὸ λεγόμενον δὴ τοῦτο ἐν τῷ πίθῳ τὴν κεραμείαν ἐπιχειρεῖν μανθάνειν — "they should, as the saying is, try to learn pottery by starting on a wine-jar". It was quoted by many authors and included as a common proverb without attribution into the collection "Proverbia Alexandrinorum" ascribed to Plutarch (Ps.-Plutarch, Παροιμίαι αἶς 'Άλεξανδρεῖς ἐχρῶντο: F.G. Schneidewin - E.L. von Leutsch [eds.], Corpus paroemiographorum Graecorum, vol. 1, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Göttingen 1839 [repr. Olms, Hildesheim 1965], pp. 321-42, see p. 338 [No. 12]).

⁸⁰ Cf. Theon, Progymnasmata, p. 59.12 Spengel (Rhetores Graeci, ed. L. Spengel, vol. 2, Teubner, Leipzig 1854).

[3] Or. 2, §49: λῆρος πλατὺς τὰ ὀνείρατα — "Dreams are utter drivel".81 Syriac:82 who ich who ich za.

The sentence is not explicitly characterized as a proverb by Gregory. It is not found in this function by other Christian or non-Christian authors, and its attribution to "the same author", i.e. Menander, seems to be unfounded.

[4] Or. 23, \$6: καὶ γὰρ τὴν σιωπὴν συγκατάθεσιν εἶναι, διδάσκει καὶ ἡ παροιμία. — "As the saying goes, 'Silence is assent'".83

Syriac:84 Klas ex els khasle, mohok i in kohe.

As in [2], Gregory quotes these words as an anonymous proverb, and its popularity both in antiquity and in the modern time found expression in numerous references to it by different authors. Its attribution to Menander found in the margin of one of the mss. 85 containing the oration and in the collection of SMMJ 124 remains quite unique.

[5] Or. 18, §7: τὸ δ' αὐτὸ δοκεῖ καὶ τοῖς ἔξωθεν· εἴπερ ἐκείνων τὸ, Γυναικὸς ἀνὴρ χρῆμ' οὐδὲν ληίζεται κάλλιον ἐσθλῆς, οὐδὲ γεῖρον τῆς ἐναντίας. — "Even those outside are of the same mind, if they say that a man can win no fairer prize than a good wife, nor a worse one than her opposite".86 The Syriac version of Paul:87

מי, ויש בו מי, שבו אם למלש וכן לבו אומס דומט מי, מי, ויש במלא ושל אב כל מי, ויש במלא ושל בל אב כל right felos by in seis.

The saying goes back to Hesiod⁸⁸ and it was included in both Christian and non-Christian gnomic anthologies.⁸⁹ Its attribution to Demosthenes is found in the margins of the Syriac mss. containing this oration⁹⁰ and it appears also in the collection of SMMJ.

[6] Or. 27, \$5: ώς Σολομῶντι κἀμοὶ δοκεῖ, καὶ τὸ καλὸν οὐ καλόν, ὅταν μὴ καλῶς γίνηται — "As it seems to Solomon, and also to me: Something good is not good unless it happens at the right time".91 The Syriac version: 92 Kan hrise al, that rhise mhr Kl rhaisea.

The allusion to Salomon by Gregory evidently implies the passage about the proper time for every activity in Eccl. 3:1. The specific expression used by Gregory is identified as a maxim by the Syriac

⁸¹ PG 35, 457C - 460A = 156 Bernardi. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 215a.

⁸² Or. 2, § 49.22, versio nova (105 Haelewyck).

⁸³ PG 35, 1157B = 292 Mossay [Grégoire de Nazianze, Discours 20-23, SC 270, éd. par J. Mossay, Éditions du Cerf, Paris 1980]. English translation: Vinson, Select Orations (above, n. 58), p. 135.

⁸⁴ BL Add. 14548, f. 58v8-9 = BL Add. 12153, f. 49vb12-14.

⁸⁵ BL Add. 14548, f. 58v, right margin: מבלא המענונים שבו המשמבים.

⁸⁶ PG 35, 993A. The English translation (with small modifications) from: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 256b. The Syriac version of the oration remains unpublished.

⁸⁷ BL Add. 14548, f. 90r21-23 = BL Add. 12153, f. 83va26-30.

⁸⁸ Hesiod, Opera et Dies 701-702: οὐ μὲν γάρ τι γυναικὸς ἀνὴρ ληίζετ' ἄμεινον τῆς ἀγαθῆς — "For a man wins nothing better than a good wife" (Hesiodi Opera, ed. F. Solmsen, Clarendon Press, Oxford 1970, p. 79).

⁸⁹ Clemens Alexandrinus, Stromateis 6.2.13 (Clemens Alexandrinus, Stromata, vol. 2, ed. O. Stählin, Akademie-Verlag, Berlin 1960, p. 432.6-7); Eusebius, PE 10.3.18 (Eusebius, Werke, ed. K. Mras, vol. 8.1, 2nd ed., Akademie-Verlag, Berlin 1982, p. 565.4-5).

⁹⁰ It is found both in BL *Add*. 14548 and BL *Add*. 12153 near the corresponding passages.

⁹¹ PG 36, 16B-D = 80 Gallay. Cf. Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 286a.

⁹² Or. 27, §4.20-21 versio nova (15 Haelewyck).

scholar, and it is found in the same form by Origenes,93 though also in this case no connection to the monostichs of Menander may be traced.

[7] Or. 29, \$2: οὐ γὰρ δὴ ὑπέργυσιν ἀγαθότητος εἰπεῖν θαρρήσομεν, ὁ τῶν παρ' "Ελλησι φιλοσοφησάντων εἰπεῖν τις ἐτόλμησεν — "For we shall not venture to speak of an overflow of goodness, as one of the Greek philosophers dared to say".94

The Syriac version of Paul:95

מ, ואו ב, מנו ב ולחול עובא בילושו בינו ונאובי אכיני ואת א א בא כנו נואבי

The Greek philosopher criticized by Gregory must have been Plotinus who spoke about God as "the Good" which is self-overflowing (cf. Enn. V 2[11], 1.8). The attribution of these words to Plutarch finds no parallel among the works of the latter.

Five other sentences may be associated with the orations of Gregory only with some degree of assurance:

[8] Cf. Or. 32, \$27: γνῶθι σαυτὸν πρῶτον — "Know thyself first of all".96

The Syriac version: 97 has a who was

This sentence was a paradigmatic moral maxim and was ascribed to different authors, probably also to Solon. The addition "and do not elevate yourself" is not found in Gregory, but it seems to sum up the argument which Gregory elaborates in the whole paragraph where this maxim is found. A similar slight modification of the wording of Gregory is characteristic of the next maxim which is found in the same discourse.

[9] Cf. Or. 32, §26: πρᾶγμά τι λόγου κρεῖττον — "A marvel beyond word".98

The Syriac translation which has a rather different wording:99 حملة حر حللة عديد الماء ال

The passage containing the extracted words focuses on the limits of rhetoric and includes a number of proverbs. 100

[10] Cf. Or. 2, \$77: παραφρονῶν λέγω, ἀλλ' οὖν εἰρήσεται· ταῦτα μὲν οὐ τῶν πολλῶν ἴσως ἐγενόμην φαυλότερος. — "I speak foolishly, but it shall be said, in these pursuits I was perhaps not inferior to many".101

⁹³ Cf. Origenes, Homily on Luke, II § 17 [Origenes Werke, ed. M. Rauer, vol. 9, Berlin 1930 (GCS 49), p. 19b2-3].

^{94 180.6-8} Gallay, cf. PG 36, 76C. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 301b.

⁹⁵ Or. 29, §2.28-30 versio nova (141 Haelewyck).

⁹⁶ PG 36, 204D = 142 Moreschini. English translation: Vinson, Select Orations (above, n. 58), p. 210. Oration 32 has been preserved in mss. BL Add. 14549 [eighth/ninth centuries, cf. Wright, Catalogue (above, n. 2), vol. 2, pp. 428-31] and Harvard Syr. 64 (seventh/eighth centuries). Cf. on both mss.: Van Roey-Moors, II (above, n. 46), pp. 108-14.

⁹⁷ BL Add. 14549, f. 11rb, lines 17-18.

⁹⁸ PG 36, 204C = 140 Moreschini. English translation: Vinson, Select Orations (above, n. 58), p. 210.

⁹⁹ BL Add. 14549, f. 11rb, line 4.

^{100 &}quot;Let Solomon's advice be your guide: 'Better is a little with security than much with uncertainty' (Prov. 5:16) and, 'Better is a poor man who walks in his integrity' (Prov. 19:1, 28:6 LXX), another of his wise sayings; that is, the man poor in words and understanding, who uses simple expressions and clings to them as to a flimsy raft in his effort to survive, is better than the unctuous fool who in his ignorance takes pride in feats of logic and by his facility with words empties the cross of Christ of its power (1 Cor. 1:17), a marvel beyond word, and thereby through logic and its inadequacy degrades the truth" [Vinson, Select Orations (above, n. 58), p. 210, emphasis mine].

¹⁰¹ PG 35, 484C = 192 Bernardi. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 221a.

بطيع مده مر مديرة رى بعله.

The words of Gregory contain an allusion to 2 Cor. 11:23.

[11] Cf. Or. 2, §13: ἢ τῆς παροιμίας μὴ πόρρω θέωμεν, ἄλλους ἰατρεύειν ἐπιχειροῦντες αὐτοὶ βρύοντες ἕλχεσι — "... barely escaping the proverb that we undertake to heal others while ourselves are full of sores".103

The Syriac version: 104 Li out to oct to syriac version: 21 ut is continued it oct to . حسقع

The sentence which Gregory uses appears by a number of ancient authors in the form ἄλλων ἰατρὸς αὐτὸς ἕλκεσιν βρύων (Suda [No. 3691] ascribes it to Euripides).

[12] Cf. Or. 31, §§15-16: Οὐκ οἶδα δέ, εἰ μὴ καὶ ἄγγελοι καὶ πᾶσα φύσις ἡ ἄνω μετὰ τὴν Τριάδα, κἂν άπλοῖ τινὲς ὧσι, καὶ πρὸς τὸ καλὸν παγιώτεροι τῆ πρὸς τὸ ἄκρον καλὸν ἐγγύτητι. Οἴ τε γὰρ παρ' Έλλήνων σεβόμενοι θεοί τε καὶ δαίμονες, ὡς αὐτοὶ λέγουσιν, οὐδὲν ήμῶν δέονται κατηγόρων, άλλά τοῖς σφῶν αὐτῶν άλίσκονται θεολόγοις, ὡς μὲν ἐμπαθεῖς, ὡς δὲ στασιώδεις, ὅσων δὲ κακῶν γέμοντες καὶ μεταβολῶν (...) — "And perhaps the same may be said of the angels and the whole of that superior nature which is second to the Trinity alone; although they are simple in some measure and more fixed in good, owing to their nearness to the highest Good. Nor do those whom the Greeks worship as gods, and (to use their own expression) demons, need us in any respect for their accusers, but are convicted upon the testimony of their own theologians, some as subject to passion, some as given to faction, and full of innumerable evils and changes ...". 105

The Syriac translation of this passage 106 stresses the state of "being fixed in good" (is a had had and of "nearness to the highest Good" (خعيه خدمه بنده ملك المدل ا opposed to the "evils" (حنعلام) of the false sages among the Greeks. This opposition could have given an impulse for an aphoristic commentary in form of the maxim which closes the collection.

Most of the gnomic sayings included in the collection derive from those passages where Gregory refers to Greek non-Christian authors without making concrete attributions. Many such cases were marked in the margins of the Syriac mss. containing the orations proposing authorship for the maxims. In some cases, the attributions turned out to be very accurate and they could have been based on reliable sources. In other cases, the names of the alleged authors seem to be accidental.

The attributions in the anthology of SMMJ are not based on any known tradition and probably include the names which had played a purely symbolic function of representatives of the classical Greek tradition. Their association with the maxims and proverbs found in the orations of Gregory, however, point to the fact that the names of Menander, Demosthenes and Democritus still stood for the short moral maxims in Syriac schools as late as in the ninth century when the ms. was copied.

¹⁰² Or. 2, §77.19-21 versio nova (151 Haelewyck).

¹⁰³ PG 35, 424A = 106 Bernardi. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), p. 207b.

¹⁰⁴ Or. 2, §13.4-5 versio nova (45 Haelewyck).

¹⁰⁵ PG 36, 149B-C = 304–306 Gallay. English translation: Browne-Swallow, Orations (above, n. 52), 322b (slightly modified, emphasis mine).

¹⁰⁶ Or. 31, §§15-16 versio nova (349 Haelewyck).

The evidence listed above adds new details to the image of Menander in Syriac literature. It closely associates the name of the Greek poet with the scholastic environment. The Syriac reception of Menander and the gnomic materials associated with his name reflect the change of educational models that took place in Syria and Palestine in the Late Antique and early medieval periods.

This development may be roughly summarized as follows:

- 1) The comedies of Menander were known in the Syriac urban centers that were influenced by the Greek education and culture, e.g. in the Antioch on Orontes, before the fourth century¹⁰⁷ and could have been present even in Syriac monastic libraries.¹⁰⁸
- 2) The collection of moral maxims which became known as the "Syriac Menander" was the product of the introduction of educational models in the late fourth-early fifth centuries expressed in the monastic rules of Basil of Caesarea, which established the Bible, especially the books of Proverbs and Sirach, as alternatives to the gnomic collections attributed to Menander.
- 3) The Syriac translation of the Euthalian apparatus in the early sixth century gave Syriac scholars examples of non-Christian gnomic sayings (including a sentence of Menander) in the context of the Bible. The separate transmission of the few "pagan *exempla*" from the Euthalian apparatus in Syriac mss. bears witness to the importance of this channel.
- 4) The Euthalian method of identification of non-Christian "testimonies" inside the New Testament books was applied to other authoritative texts, e.g., to the biblical quotations in the treatises of Philoxenos, which in BL *Add.* 14598 were supplemented by the sentences of the Syriac Menander.
- 5) The application of the Euthalian method to the orations of Gregory of Nazianzus in the context of the Syriac schools in the seventh-ninth centuries produced a corpus of gnomic materials identified in the writings of Gregory and transmitted in the form of gnomic collections. The collection of sentences in *SMMJ* 124 taken from the orations of Gregory included five sayings attributed to Menander. In one of these sayings, the name of the Greek playwright is associated with the biblical wisdom literature, revealing the channels of transmission of Menander's image in Syriac literature.

¹⁰⁷ Cf. K. Gutzwiller - Ö. Çelik, "New Menander Mosaics from Antioch", *American Journal of Archaeology* 116.4 (2012), pp. 573-623.

¹⁰⁸ Cf. F. D'Aiuto, "*Graeca* in codici orientali della Biblioteca Vaticana (con i resti di un manoscritto tardoantico delle commedie di Menandro)", in L. Perria (ed.), *Tra Oriente e Occidente: scritture e libri greci fra le regioni orientali di Bisanzio e l'Italia*, Dipartimento di filologia greca e latina Sezione bizantino-neoellenica Università di Roma "La Sapienza", Roma 2003 (Testi e studi bizantino-neoellenici, 14), pp. 227-96.